Scenario 11: Comparing Rules

Note: Rules referenced in this presentation are existing statutes. The relevant portions appear at:

Scenario 11: What can the FBI share?
Can I give this information to the St. Lucie Police?

Translation:

1. Am I allowed to give the information:
   1. Under my organization’s rules?
   2. Under any rules that came with the information when we got it?

2. Will I get in trouble for giving the information?
   1. What will the recipient do with it?
Can I give this information to the St. Lucie Police?

Translation:

1. Am I allowed to give the information:
   1. Under my organization’s rules?
   2. Under any rules that came with the information when we got it?

2. Will I get in trouble for giving the information?
   1. What will the recipient do with it?
Can I give this information to the St. Lucie Police?

Translation:

1. ...
2. Will I get in trouble for giving the information?
   1. What will the recipient do with it?

Likely Answers:

- Already have an agreement governing use
- Recipient’s use restrictions are narrower than yours
- Recipient’s use restrictions are broader than yours
What would the UI look like?

What will {Florida:St_Lucie:Police} do with {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A}?

{Florida:St_Lucie:Police} will permit
• use for the following authorized purpose: {xxxxxxxxxxxxx, xxxxxxxxxxxxx}
• dissemination {same as} your organization
For this example:

Assume time had passed…
St. Lucie had closed its case
What would the UI look like?

What will {Florida:St_Lucie:Police} do with {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A}?

{Florida:St_Lucie:Police} will permit
• use for the following authorized purpose: {xxxxxxxxxxx, xxxxxxxxxxxxx}  Why?
• dissemination {broader than} your organization  Why?
What will {Florida:St_Lucie:Police} do with {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A}?

{Florida:St_Lucie:Police} will permit
- use for the following authorized purpose: {xxxxxxxxxxxxx, xxxxxxxxxxxxxx}
- dissemination {broader than} your organization

• Disseminate {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A} to Requestor{any} for authorized_purpose{any}?  
  • {Florida:St_Lucie:Police}: yes  
  • {FBI}: no
What will {Florida:St_Lucie:Police} do with {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A}?

{Florida:St_Lucie:Police} will permit
• use for the following authorized purpose: {xxxxxxxxxxxx, xxxxxxxxxxxxxxx}
• dissemination {broader than} your organization

• Disseminate {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A} to Requestor{any} for authorized_purpose{any}?
  • {Florida:St_Lucie:Police}: yes
  • {FBI}: no

• Rule: {Florida:Sunshine} applies to {digital_records:Florida:city:any}
  • Fact: {St_Lucie} is a {Florida:city:any}
  • Fact: {IDW:Extract_Report} is {digital_records}
  • Result: {Florida:Sunshine} applies to {St_Lucie} record {IDW:Extract_Report}
• Rule: {Florida:Sunshine} requires dissemination of {digital_records:Florida:city:any} to {requestor} for {authorized_purpose:any}
• Exception for {active} {criminal intelligence}
  • Definition: {criminal intelligence} = {data}
    + owned_by{law_enforcement_agency}
    + (collected_for{law_enforcement} or category {PII})
  • Fact: {St_Lucie:Police} = {law_enforcement_agency}
  • Fact: {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A} category {PII}
  • Result: {IDW:Extract...] is {criminal_intelligence}
  • Fact: {active} flag = NO
  • Result: Exception does not apply

• Result: {Florida:Sunshine} requires {Florida:St_Lucie:Police} to disseminate {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A} to requestor{any} for authorized_purpose{any}
• Disseminate \{IDW:Extract\_Report:Lewis\_Theodore\_A\} to Requestor\{any\} for authorized\_purpose\{any\}?
  • \{FBI\}: no

• \{US:FOIA\} applies to \{information:Federal\_agency\}
  • Fact: \{FBI\} is a \{Federal\_agency\}
  • Fact: \{IDW:Extract\_Report\} is a \{information\}
  • Result: \{US:FOIA\} \{applies to\} \{FBI\} \{IDW:Extract\_Report\}

• \{US:FOIA\} \{requires\} dissemination of \{information\} to \{requestor\} for \{authorized\_purpose:any\}
  • Exception for authorized\_purpose\{law\_enforcement\}
    + case\{active\} + subject\{not\_informed\}
    • Fact: \{IDW:Extract\_Report:Lewis\_Theodore\_A\} = authorized\_purpose\{law\_enforcement\}
    • Fact: \{IDW:Extract\_Report:Lewis\_Theodore\_A\} = case\{active\}
    • Fact: \{IDW:Extract\_Report:Lewis\_Theodore\_A\} = subject\{not\_informed\}
    • Exception = apply
    • Result = \{US:FOIA\} \{does not require\} dissemination of \{IDW:Extract\_Report:Lewis\_Theodore\_A\} to Requestor\{any\} for authorized\_purpose\{any\}
For this example:

Assume our system is Super smart!
What would the UI look like?

What will {Florida:St_Lucie:Police} do with {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A}?

{Florida:St_Lucie:Police} will permit
• use for the following authorized purpose: {xxxxxxxxxxxxx, xxxxxxxxxxxxxx} [Why?]
• dissemination {same as} your organization [Why?]
What will {Florida:St_Lucie:Police} do with {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A}?

{Florida:St_Lucie:Police} will permit
• use for the following authorized purpose: {xxxxxxxxxxxxx, xxxxxxxxxxxxx}
• dissemination {same as} your organization

• Rule: {Florida:Sunshine} applies to {digital_records:Florida:city:any}
  • Fact: {St_Lucie} is a {Florida:city:any}
  • Fact: {IDW:Extract_Report} is {digital_records}
  • Result: {Florida:Sunshine} applies to {St_Lucie} record {IDW:Extract_Report}
• Rule: {Florida:Sunshine} {requires} dissemination of {digital_records:Florida:city:any} to {requestor} for {authorized_purpose:any}
• Special Exception for data{criminal intelligence}
  + source{other_criminal_justice_agency}
  • Definition: {criminal intelligence} = {data}
    + owned_by{law_enforcement_agency}
    + (collected_for{law_enforcement} or category {PII})
  • Fact: {St_Lucie:Police} = {law_enforcement_agency}
  • Fact: {IDW:Extract_Report:Lewis_Theodore_A} category {PII}
  • Result: {IDW:Extract...} {is} {criminal_intelligence}
  • Definition: {other_criminal_justice_agency} = {≠}{Florida} + Authorized_purpose{law_enforcement:criminal}
  • Fact: FBI {≠} {Florida}
  • Fact: FBI authorized_purpose{law_enforcement:criminal}
  • Result: Exception {does} apply
  • Special Exception is source{use_rule} {applies}
    if source{use_rule} flag = YES
  • Fact: source is {FBI}
  • Fact: {FBI}{use_rule} flag = YES